

Hi Tracey,

I'd like to request that not only my letters to you be included into the Public Record and attached to the Agenda Item concerning Commission Appointments, but also your replies.

Thank you very much,

I realize time is short and you are working hard.

Thank you very much for your assistance.

Bethany

On Jun 22, 2017, at 10:00 AM, Tracey Martinez <[tmartinez@cathedralcity.gov](mailto:tmartinez@cathedralcity.gov)> wrote:

Hi Bethany,

Below in red are my answers to your questions. If you have any further questions please let me know.

Thank you,

Tracy

**From:** Bethany Ballard [<mailto:bjinps@dc.rr.com>]

**Sent:** Tuesday, June 20, 2017 5:06 PM

**To:** Tracey Martinez <[TMartinez@cathedralcity.gov](mailto:TMartinez@cathedralcity.gov)>

**Subject:** Re: question about emails, SM , MIS Info&Tech Dept.

Thank you Tracey,

1. Did anyone, and if so, who, forwarded to you a recent email I sent the Council Members and City Manager concerning the Public Arts Commissioners appointments? **Yes, the City Manager forwarded your email to me as he does all emails that request to be made part of the record.**

2. And if so, please, what date and time did you receive it? **It was forwarded to me on Thursday, June 15, 2017 at 7:46 a.m.**

3. What date and time was it made public? **It has not been made public.**

4. And what date and time was it placed in the Public Record, attached to the Agenda Item as requested? **It will be attached to the Staff Report on Monday. I try and post comments for the record prior to the Council Meeting to avoid going in multiple times. I also provide a hard copy to the City Council at the Meeting.**

3. Do you know if Alan Carvalho or Tim Parrott was informed about or was forwarded the email by any member of the City Council or by the City Manager ? **I am unaware of your message being forwarded to Alan Carvalho or Tim Parrott, I can only speak for myself and that I did not and I am certain the City Manager did not either.**

Because the two said commissioners discussed it on public Social Media where I was named and insulted.

Below is a portion of a public Social Media comment which was forwarded to me. I would like it to be attached to the Agenda Item for Public Record as was my first email on the subject of Public Arts Commissioners appointments. (If you have not received it I can provide a copy, or you can ask the City Manager to forward my email on the subject). These public comments and discussion of City Business on Social Media from The Chairman of the PAC Commission, Alan Carvalho, and another PAC Commissioner are examples of what my complaint was about and self explanatory. This is only what I am aware of that names me, however, there are many who have receive worse ongoing character assassinations, both male and female. **I have received your request to add the comments made on social media and I will include it with your other comments.**



**The anti CCNag page: investigating lies** BETHANY just wrote a letter asking that a certain member of the public arts commission not be renewed. The hard work of volunteering, offering free video and photo services, working closely with the High School DATA program, annual award events, promoting music for the annual stardust event, none of that seems to matter. Personal attacks, that comes naturally to them. HMMM, can't imagine that someone like the former mayor might have penned that hostile gem of a note!

[Like](#) [Show More Reactions](#)

· [Reply](#) ·

1

· 5 hrs · [Edited](#)



**Tim A Parrott** Cunts

[Like](#) [Show More Reactions](#)

· [Reply](#) ·

1

· 3 hrs

Additionally I would like to know how my email which was not addressed to Mr. Carvalho was obtained by him?

Did Mr. Kaplan give it to him? or did Mr. Carvalho help himself to someone's Official City Email Account?

Thank you,

Bethany Ballard

(Please enter into the Public Record attached to the appropriate Agenda Item having to do with the upcoming appointments for PAC commissioners).

On Jun 20, 2017, at 9:14 AM, Tracey Martinez <[TMartinez@cathedralcity.gov](mailto:TMartinez@cathedralcity.gov)> wrote:

Hi Bethany,

Please see the responses to your questions below. If you have any further questions please let me know.

Thank you,  
Tracey

**From:** Bethany Ballard [<mailto:bjinps@dc.rr.com>]  
**Sent:** Sunday, June 18, 2017 4:40 PM  
**To:** Tracey Martinez <[TMartinez@cathedralcity.gov](mailto:TMartinez@cathedralcity.gov)>  
**Subject:** question about emails, SM , MIS Info&Tech Dept.

Dear Tracey,  
I have a few questions.

1. How soon does an email to the City Council become available to you when not addressed to you? **Only emails that are forwarded to me are available to me.**
2. How soon does that email become available to the rest of **city employees** (like city manager), and **non-employees** (such as commissioners) after you receive it? **Emails are not made available to other employees or commissioners unless the recipient forwards it to another staff member or commission member to assist with answering questions or provide documents.**
3. Would this be the same amount of time the email is placed in the public record? or is that done somewhat later? **Emails are a matter of public record until the 15 day retention expires.**
4. Are all letters to city hall, public record or only those requested to be in the placed in the public record? **If someone is commenting on a City Council Agenda Item and requests that their comments be made part of the record then that document will be attached to that Agenda Item. If the City receives correspondence it will be a Public Document for as long as the retention schedule requires. A Public Record is different than being made part of the record.**
5. Is [Nextdoor.com](http://Nextdoor.com) considered a "City Social Media Site" seeing the city has an account on that site and to my recollection recommended (or offered) the residents to sign-up with Nextdoor to better communicate with neighbors. [Nextdoor.com](http://Nextdoor.com) is not a "City Social Media Site." It is a social media site that the City will post information on in order to inform residents about community news, events or City functions.
6. Does Alan Carvalho, or Tim Parrott, have "Authorization" from either CM Charlie or the Account Administrator Parman to use, post, comment on City Social Media Sites. **Only authorized individuals can post on behalf of the City. Currently, there are only three people authorized to post on behalf of the City. They include City Manager Charles McClendon, and the two Account Administrators, Communications/Events Manager Chris Parman and Webmaster and Graphic Designer Kevin Lockwood. Anyone from the community can post on City Social Media Sites in the comment section.**

Unrelated questions:

1. How many years have we had the MIS-Information Technology Department? **Since the mid 90's.**

2.What is the Name of the the Head of the Department? **Tami Scott, Administrative Services Director.**

Thank you,  
Bethany Ballard